



**Phase II Long Term Control Plan  
Alternative Analysis and  
Recommended Improvements**

Prepared for:  
City of Lancaster, Ohio

Prepared by:  
ARCADIS U.S., Inc.  
100 E. Campus View Blvd., Suite 200  
Columbus, OH 43235  
Tel 614 985 9100  
Fax 614 985 9170

Our Ref.:  
0491066.0000

Date:  
July 25, 2014

**RECEIVED  
CITY OF LANCASTER**

**JUL 25 2014**

**ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT  
FILE No. \_\_\_\_\_**





**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

<b>ES.1</b>	<b>Purpose of Long Term Control Plan</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>ES.2</b>	<b>History of Combined Sewer System Work in Lancaster</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>ES.3</b>	<b>Stream Water Quality History</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>ES.4</b>	<b>The Cost of CSO Projects to Date</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>ES.5</b>	<b>Phase II Long Term Control Plan Goals</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>ES.6</b>	<b>Flow Monitoring</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>ES.7</b>	<b>Wastewater Collection System Model</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>ES.8</b>	<b>Alternatives Development and Evaluation</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>ES.9</b>	<b>Opinion of Probable Capital Costs for Alternatives</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>ES.10</b>	<b>Recommended Alternative</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>ES.11</b>	<b>Post Construction Monitoring</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>ES.12</b>	<b>Financial Capability and Affordability</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>ES.13</b>	<b>Socioeconomic Conditions</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>ES.14</b>	<b>Implementation Schedule</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>ES.15</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>1.</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>23</b>
1.1	Background	23
1.1.1	General	23
1.1.2	NPDES Permit Compliance Schedule History	24
1.1.3	CSO Project History	28
1.1.4	Water Quality Standard Compliance History	29
1.1.5	Cost for Improvements	30
1.2	Regulatory Status	31
1.3	Level of Service and Compliance Goals	32

# PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

## Table of Contents



1.4	Public Participation Program	33
1.5	Long Term Control Plan Criteria	34
<b>2.</b>	<b>Flow Monitoring Program and Model Development Overview</b>	<b>37</b>
2.1	Flow Monitoring Program	37
2.1.1	Flow Monitoring	37
2.1.2	Rainfall Monitoring	41
2.2	Combined Sewer System Model	42
2.2.1	2012 Existing Conditions Model	43
2.2.2	2014 Baseline Conditions with 2035 Growth Model	43
<b>3.</b>	<b>Alternatives Analysis</b>	<b>47</b>
3.1	Initial Screening of CSO Technologies	48
3.1.1	Sewer System Optimization	49
3.1.2	Sewer Separation	49
3.1.3	Storage	49
3.2	Alternative Evaluation	50
3.3	Water in Basement Analysis	50
3.4	Sewer Separation Analysis Planning Areas	53
3.5	Planning Area ALTW Alternatives	58
3.5.1	Alternative 2W7A	58
3.5.2	Alternative 3W	64
3.5.3	Alternative 4W	71
3.5.4	Alternative 5W	75
3.5.5	Alternative 6W	79
3.5.6	Alternative 7W	83
3.5.1	Alternative 8W	88
3.6	Planning Area ALTE Alternatives	92
3.6.1	Alternative 2E	93



## PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

### Table of Contents

3.6.2	Alternative 3E	97
3.6.3	Alternative 4E	101
3.7	Alternatives Performance Summary	105
<b>4.</b>	<b>Opinion of Probable Capital Costs</b>	<b>109</b>
4.1	Quantity Development	109
4.2	Work Breakdown Structure	109
4.3	Unit Costs	109
4.4	Alternatives - Opinion of Probable Capital Costs	110
<b>5.</b>	<b>Recommended Solution</b>	<b>111</b>
5.1	Alternatives Selection	111
5.2	Selection of Projects	114
5.3	Development of the Recommended Solution Projects	115
5.4	Performance of Recommended Solution Projects	119
5.5	Equalization Facility Modifications	122
5.6	Recommended Solution Opinion of Probable Capital Costs	122
5.7	Water Quality Standards	122
5.8	Post Construction Monitoring	123
<b>6.</b>	<b>Project Implementation</b>	<b>125</b>
6.1	Financial Capability Assessment and Affordability	125
6.1.1	Introduction	125
6.1.2	Customer Bill Comparison	125
6.1.3	USEPA Financial Capability Assessment	127
6.1.3.1	Residential Indicator	127
6.1.3.2	Community Financial Capability Indicators	128
6.1.3.3	The Financial Capability Matrix for Wastewater	129
6.1.3.4	Combined Water, Wastewater, and Stormwater Residential Indicator	130
6.1.3.5	Summary of Assessment	131

# PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

## Table of Contents



6.1.4	Rate Impact Analysis	131
6.1.5	Non-residential Affordability	132
6.1.6	Socioeconomic Conditions	133
6.2	Implementation Schedule	134
6.3	Findings and Conclusions	135



## PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

### Table of Contents

#### Tables

Table 1-1	Pump Stations	24
Table 1-2	CSO Strategy Regulatory Submittals	28
Table 1-3	CSO Reduction Costs	31
Table 1-4	Summary of NPDES Compliance Schedule	32
Table 1-5	Public Participation Schedule	33
Table 2-1	Monitoring Locations	38
Table 2-2	Typical Year CSO Statistics	46
Table 3-1	West Side Storm Sewer Separation Projects by CSO	55
Table 3-2	East Side Storm Sewer Separation Projects by CSO	57
Table 3-3	Summary of Planning Area ALTW Alternatives	58
Table 3-4	Proposed Improvements for ALT2W7A	60
Table 3-5	ALT2W7A versus the Allowable Design	61
Table 3-6	ALT2W7A WIB & Compliance Point Elevation versus the Typical Year Max HGL	62
Table 3-7	Proposed Improvements for ALT3W3A	66
Table 3-8	Proposed Improvements for ALT3W4A	68
Table 3-9	ALT3W3A versus the Allowable Design	69
Table 3-10	ALT3W4A versus the Allowable Design	70
Table 3-11	Proposed Improvements for ALT4W3A1	73
Table 3-12	ALT4W3A1 versus the Allowable Design	74
Table 3-13	Proposed Improvements for Alt5W7A2	77
Table 3-14	ALT5W7A2 versus the Allowable Design	78
Table 3-15	Proposed Improvements for Alt6W7A2	81
Table 3-16	ALT6W7A-2 versus the Allowable Design	82
Table 3-17	Proposed Improvements for ALT7A	85
Table 3-18	ALT7W7A versus the Allowable Design	87
Table 3-19	Proposed Improvements for Alt8W7A1	90

# PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

## Table of Contents



Table 3-20	ALT8W7A1 versus the Allowable Design	91
Table 3-21	Summary of Developed East Side Alternatives	92
Table 3-22	Proposed Improvements for ALT2E1A	95
Table 3-23	ALT2E1A versus the Allowable Design	96
Table 3-24	Proposed Improvements for ALT3E1A2	99
Table 3-25	ALT3E1A2 versus the Allowable Design	100
Table 3-26	Proposed Improvement for ALT4E1A	103
Table 3-27	ALT4E1A verse the Allowable Design	104
Table 3-28	Summary of West Side Overflows by Alternative	106
Table 3-29	Summary of East Side Overflows by Alternative	108
Table 4-1	Westside Alternatives Opinion of Probable Capital Costs	110
Table 4-2	Eastside Alternatives Opinion of Probable Capital Costs	110
Table 5	Alternative Rankings	113
Table 5-2	Recommended Solution Projects	117
Table 5-3	Recommended Solution versus the Allowable Design	120
Table 5-4	Recommended Solution Overflow Summary	121
Table 6-1	USEPA Financial Impact Ranges	127
Table 6-3	Wastewater Financial Capability Matrix Score	130
Table 6-4	Calculation of Combined Residential Indicator	130
Table 6-5	Anchor Hocking Location Comparison	133



## PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

### Table of Contents

#### Figures

Figure 1-1	Collection System Schematic	35
Figure 2-1	Flow Monitoring Sites	40
Figure 2-2	Rain Gauge Locations	41
Figure 2-3	2012 Existing Conditions CSO Status	44
Figure 3-1	Planning Areas	52
Figure 3-2	West Side Storm Sewer Separation Projects	54
Figure 3-3	East Side Storm Sewer Separation Projects	56
Figure 3-4	ALT2W7A – Weir and underflow modifications to maximize the interceptor	59
Figure 3-5	CSO 1008 & 1009 WIB Analysis	63
Figure 3-6	ALT3W3A	65
Figure 3-7	ALT3W4A	67
Figure 3-8	ALT4W3A1	72
Figure 3-9	ALT5W7A2	76
Figure 3-10	ALT6W7A2	80
Figure 3-11	ALT7W7A	84
Figure 3-12	ALT8W7A1	89
Figure 3-13	ALT2E1A	94
Figure 3-14	ALT3E1A2	98
Figure 3-15	ALT4E1A	102
Figure 5-1	Recommended Solution Projects (attached)	123
Figure 6-1	Residential Annual Wastewater Bill Survey	126
Figure 6-2	Residential Annual Water Bill Survey	126
Figure 6-3	Residential Annual Wastewater and Water Bill Survey	126
Figure 6-4	Median Household Income by Census Tract (2014 Dollars)	128
Figure 6-5	Annual Estimated Wastewater Bill as a Percentage of MHI	132
Figure 6-6	2025 CSO Compliance CIP (attached)	136
Figure 6-7	2035 CSO Compliance CIP (attached)	136

# PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

## Table of Contents\*



### Appendices

- A Lawrence Street WPCF Large Pump Stations
- B CSO Modifications
- C CSO Overflow Volumes and Occurrences Technical Memorandum
- D Compliance Schedule Correspondence
- E Public Participation Program
- F Runoff Catchments
- G Future Flows
- H Compliance Pointst
- I Alternatives Modeling Results
- J Alternatives Opinion of Probable Capital Costs
- K Recommended Solution Modeling Results
- L Lawrence Street Equalization and Pump Station Planning
- M Recommended Solution - Opinion of Probable Capital Costs
- N Capital Improvement Plans
- O Financial Capability Assessment and Affordability Study



**Acronyms and Abbreviations**

- CIP – Capital Improvement Projects
- CSO – Combined Sewer Overflow
- EPA – Environmental Protection Agency
- EQ – Equalization
- FT – Feet
- HGL – Hydraulic Grade Line
- HRS – Hours
- LTCP – Long Term Control Plan
- MGD – Million Gallon per Day
- NPDES – National Pollution Discharge Elimination System
- OEPA – Ohio Environmental Protection Agency
- RDII – Rainfall-Derived Infiltration and Inflow
- SWMM – Storm Water Management Model
- USEPA – United States Environmental Protection Agency
- WIB – Water in Basement
- WPCF – Water Pollution Control Facility
- WTP – Water Treatment Plant
- WWTP – Waste Water Treatment Plant

# PHASE II LONG TERM CONTROL PLAN

## Table of Contents



THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK